

File No. 15-05/GA/2014-15-FSSAI  
Food Safety and Standards Authority of India  
(General Administration Division)  
Ministry of Health and Family Welfare  
FDA Bhawan, Kotla Road, New Delhi-110002.

The 23<sup>rd</sup> June, 2015

**Subject:- Minutes of the 16<sup>th</sup> Authority Meeting held on 16<sup>th</sup> January, 2015**

While adopting/approving the minutes of the 16<sup>th</sup> Meeting of the Food Authority held on 16<sup>th</sup> January, 2015 in its 17<sup>th</sup> Meeting held on 18<sup>th</sup> May, 2015, attention was drawn to the observations made by Ms. Shreya Pandey on Item No. V (1) regarding the Policy for Time frame for FSS Regulations to come into force and also handed over some written comments.

2. The CEO clarified that the member had every opportunity to make her comments on the subject during the course of the meeting and observed that the minutes were meant to be a faithful record of the deliberations held after the meeting. However, the Chairperson observed that the written comments may be examined separately, which, if required, could be placed before the Authority in its next meeting. The minutes of the 16<sup>th</sup> Meeting of the Food Authority were adopted with the above observations and confirmed.

  
(Rakesh Chandra Sharma)  
Director (GA)

Enclosure:  
Minutes of the 16<sup>th</sup> Meeting of the Food Authority

**Minutes of the 16<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Food Authority held on January 16, 2015 at 1100 hrs at FDA Bhavan, New Delhi**

1. The sixteenth meeting of the Food Safety and Standards Authority of India (FSSAI) was held on January 16, 2015 at 1100 hrs. at FDA Bhavan, Kotla Road, New Delhi under the Chairmanship of Shri K. Chandramouli, Chairperson, FSSAI. The list of participants present in the meeting is at **Annexure I**. Leave of absence was granted to the members who could not attend.
2. Chairperson welcomed the members of the Authority to the meeting and introduced the new Chief Executive Officer, Shri Y.S. Malik to all the members. He recalled that the last Authority meeting was held on 20<sup>th</sup> August 2014 and informed that an extensive exercise had begun to harmonize the food standards with the Codex standards in April 2013. The outcome of this harmonization exercise was culminating in the standards that had been brought before the Authority for approval under various Agenda items. He further stated that extensive work had been undertaken between the last and the current Authority meetings in achieving the huge challenge of standards setting. He appreciated the work done by Shri S. Dave, Advisor & his team for their commendable work and highlighted that it would help in facilitating the process of product approval.
3. The Chairman further observed that India would be one of the few countries to have achieved the target of harmonizing the Indian standards with Codex Standards keeping in view the country conditions and requirement on such a vast scale. He stressed upon the fact that these were science-based standards & invited all the members of the Authority to raise any doubts, clarifications, suggestions or corrections in this behalf.
4. He observed that the process of notifying the standards is a time consuming exercise which results in inordinate delay in the finalisation of the standards. Approximately 14,000 science-based standards, already approved by the Scientific Panels and the Scientific Committee had been placed before the Authority for its approval/ adoption. However, their notification may take considerable time in view of the multi-step process. He suggested that the Authority may consider resolving that the standards approved in the current Authority meeting be implemented,



pending the notification process.

5. He further stated that the Food Authority consisted of representatives from all the stakeholders and each Member represented his/ her constituent stakeholders. Hence, the issues/ concerns of any stakeholder group should be raised by the representative members in the Authority, discussed and deliberated upon.

6. He further instructed the CEO to include the "Review of Status with reference to the Notification of Regulations and Standards" approved in the Authority meetings as a standing item for discussion in all the future Authority meetings. An ATR item should also be made a part of the Authority agenda for discussions. Thereafter, Chairperson, FSSAI requested the CEO, FSSAI to conduct the proceedings of the meeting.

**Agenda Items:      Items I to IV**

**Item No. I:    Disclosure of interest by the members**

(i) All the members present during the meeting signed the "Specific Declaration of Interest" in respect of the agenda items to be considered in the meeting, before the start of the proceedings. The CEO, FSSAI proposed that the specific declaration of interest should be required to be signed only once by a member of the Authority after the composition of the Authority and there was no need for signing the said declaration at each meeting, unless and until any member acquired such interest during the tenure and had any specific interest in any particular agenda item. In case of any of these events, it was for the member concerned to notify the Authority about his/her interest and recuse from the deliberations of any particular agenda, as the case may be. Another member also invited the attention to the fact that declaration of interest was to be an annual event and not an event for each and every meeting.

(ii) After detailed deliberations, it was decided that, henceforth, the members of the Authority may be requested to sign the declaration only once along with an undertaking that they would notify the Authority if they acquired any



interest during the mid-term at any stage and that they would disclose before the Authority if they had any interest in any particular agenda item in any meeting and recuse themselves in such a situation.

**Item No. II: Confirmation of the minutes of the last meeting held on 20<sup>th</sup> August, 2014**

- (i) The Authority confirmed the minutes of the last meeting held on 20<sup>th</sup> August, 2014. While adopting the minutes, Director (Codex), FSSAI drew attention of the house to a few points raised by Ms Meetu Kapoor, Member, regarding Agenda No. 4 on Categorization of 'Caramel' as a synthetic colour and the rationale for treating it as a synthetic colour were not reflected in the minutes. Also, Mr. Salim Veljee, Commissioner Food Safety Goa, pointed out that his name had not been mentioned in the list of participants in the minutes though he had attended the last meeting.
- (ii) The Food Authority noted the points raised by the members and adopted the minutes of the 15<sup>th</sup> Authority meeting.

**Item No. III: Action Taken Report – 15<sup>th</sup> Authority Meeting**

- (i) The Action Taken Report of the fifteenth meeting of the Food Authority had been enclosed for information of the members of the Authority. Also, it was discussed and decided to carry forward the pending Agenda items of the previous Authority Meetings in chronological order and in a standard format in the future meetings as a Standing Agenda Item.
- (ii) One of the members raised the issue of the pending Agenda items from the 13<sup>th</sup> and 14<sup>th</sup> Authority meetings pertaining to fats and oils. It was informed that these would be looked into by the proposed Working Group on Fats and Oils.

**Item No. IV: Chief Executive Officer's Report**

- (i) CEO, FSSAI welcomed all the distinguished members of the Authority and thanked them for their co-operation in Authority meetings. He then invited attention of all the members to the huge exercise of harmonization of standards wherein 14,533 standards were being placed before the Authority



in this meeting for approval. Explaining the long process involved in the issue of final notifications on the one hand, and the urgency for application of these standards to various pending applications of Product Approvals and all other new cases on the other, he proposed that the Authority may consider deciding the implementation of these standards immediately pending formal notification.

- (ii) Further, he gave a brief overview of the Product Approval activities and disclosed that a total of 763 Product Approvals had been granted since the inception of the Product Approval System, of which 241 PAs had been issued after September 2014 till date. Also, he gave an overview of the import activities, enforcement activities including the number of Central licenses, licenses issued by the registration of FBOs by the States; training and Capacity Building; Scientific Committee/ Scientific Panels meetings; and IEC activities. With respect to the Codex Activities, he highlighted that India had been made the Regional Coordinator for Asia at the 19<sup>th</sup> session of regional Coordinating Committee after 35 years. He appreciated the work done by Ms. Vinod Kotwal, Director (Codex) & her team for commendable work as the National Codex Contact Point (NCCP) in the field of Codex related matters.

**Item No. V: Regular Agenda Items:**

After the presentation of CEO's report, regular agenda items were taken up for deliberations as under:

**1. Policy for Time frame for FSS Regulations to come into force.**

The Food Authority considered and approved the policy of time-frame for FSS Regulations to come into force with effective date for implementation to be either 1<sup>st</sup> January or 1<sup>st</sup> July subject to a minimum of 180 days and in case of emergency measures, the matter may be discussed on a case to case basis. One of the members highlighted the need for publications of such Notifications in the newspapers in terms of provisions contained in the General Clauses Act. It was clarified that it may not be feasible to publish the complete Notifications in newspapers. However, the factum of such Notification having been issued could be considered for publication

in the newspapers or the News Letter of the FSSAI. The Member also suggested that the invitation of comments on the draft regulations/notifications should be sought in the form of 'affidavits' to ensure the genuineness of the persons/ institutions making such comments. The CEO explained that Affidavit was not an e-Governance friendly mode of submission and the FSSAI had even otherwise decided to substitute the "Affidavits" with 'Self declarations' in all other cases as well keeping in view that a wrongful self-declaration had the same legal consequences as an 'Affidavit'.

## **2. Harmonisation of MRLs of Pesticides in Food Commodities.**

- 2.1 The Food Authority considered the agenda containing the recommendations made by Scientific Committee w.r.t. the decision tree approach for the fixation of Maximum residue Limits (MRLs)/ Tolerance Limits for various Pesticides and Veterinary Drugs & Antibiotics including pharmacologically active substances on various food commodities. One of the members suggested inclusion of one more category of 'other fruits' for pesticide Ethephon at Sl. No. 73. However, it was mentioned that all suggestions, including the one made by the member, would be considered in the draft notification.
- 2.2 JS, Department of Agriculture observed that this notification would lead to transparency. The members were of the opinion that the data for the pesticides, veterinary drugs & antibiotics, which have not been included under this draft regulation, may be obtained in consultation with the Ministry of Agriculture.
- 2.3 In response to the query raised by one of the members regarding the analytical capacity of the laboratories to test pesticides, veterinary drugs & antibiotics, CEO, FSSAI suggested that Ministry of Food Processing Industry may also consider developing a business model for establishing good food-testing labs as MOFPI was operating an existing scheme for laboratory up gradation.
- 2.4 In principle, the Food Authority approved the "decision tree approach" and the Maximum Residue Limits (MRLs)/ Tolerance Limits for various



Pesticides and Veterinary Drugs & Antibiotics, including pharmacologically active substances, on various food commodities along with the draft notification as enclosed at **Annexure 1 to 3** of the Agenda Item subject to the legal vetting of the text.

3. **Amendment in regulation 2.2.2 in clause 3 in sub-clause (v) of Safety and Standards (Packaging and Labelling) Regulation, 2011 related to declaration of Trans Fat in nutritional information.**

The Food Authority considered the agenda and approved the recommendations made by Scientific Committee along with the draft notification as enclosed at **Annexure/4** of the Agenda Item subject to the legal vetting of the text.

4. **Amendment in regulation 2.2. Sub-regulation 2.2.2 clause 2(c) of FSS (Packaging and Labelling) Regulation, 2011 related to list of ingredients: class titles against the edible vegetable oils/edible vegetable fat classes.**

The Food Authority considered the agenda and the draft notification as enclosed at **Annexure 5** of the Agenda Item. After discussions, the Authority agreed to make changes in 2(b) of the draft notification that for the words "Give name of the edible oil" be replaced by "Give name of the source of the edible oil like mustard oil, groundnut oil etc.". The draft notification was approved with these changes.

5. **Amendment in Sub-regulation 1.2.1 clause 12 and Sub Regulation 2.6.1. (1), (2) & (5) of FSS (Packaging and Labelling) Regulation, 2011 related to Definition of Wholesale Package and Exemptions from Labelling requirements.**

The Food Authority considered the agenda and one of the members observed that sub clause (a) of Clause 12 of the Regulation would need to be retained in view of the implications of deletion thereof. The point was noted and it was finally decided to re-examine the proposal and place the same before the Authority in its next meeting.

6. **Information on Minutes of meeting of 12<sup>th</sup> Central Advisory Committee (CAC) held on 1<sup>st</sup> August, 2014**

The Food Authority noted the agenda circulated for the information of the



members of the Authority.

**7. Eligibility criteria for Centre-State Licensing and Registration.**

The Food Authority noted the agenda circulated for the information of the members of the Authority and endorsed the proposal.

**8. Standards for Processed Fruits and Vegetables.**

The Food Authority considered the agenda and approved the recommendations made by the Scientific Committee on Standards for Processed Fruits and Vegetables as circulated vide Agenda Item No. 8. In response to the technical suggestions given by the Members, Chairperson, FSSAI mentioned that all suggestions would be considered along with the comments received in response to the draft notification.

**9. Fortification of Rice.**

The Food Authority considered the agenda and decided to re-visit the Standards for Fortification of Rice in the next Authority meeting.

**10. Fortification of Edible Vegetable Oil.**

The Food Authority considered the agenda and decided to re-visit the Standards for Fortification of Edible Vegetable Oil in the next Authority meeting.

**11. Fortification of Milk**

The Food Authority considered the agenda and decided to provide the relevant technical documents based on which the standards had been framed to Dr. G.S. Toteja, Member, his comments/ recommendations to proceed further.

It was also noted by the Authority that a generic document on the guidelines for fortification needed to be prepared on the lines of Codex Document.

**12. Inclusion of new Atomic Energy (Radiation Processing of Food and Allied Products), Rules, 2012 in Food Safety and Standards (Food Products Standards and Food Additive) Regulations, 2011.**

The Food Authority considered the agenda and approved the





recommendations made by the Scientific Committee to substitute the Atomic Energy (Control of Irradiation of Food) Rules, 1991 with the new Atomic Energy (Radiation Processing of Food and Allied Products), Rules, 2012 in Regulation 2.13 of the Food Safety and Standards (Food Products Standards and Food Additive) Regulations, 2011.

**13. Approval of Microbial Standards for Fruits and Vegetable Products.**

While discussing the Agenda item, it was observed by the Authority that this item had been discussed at the last Authority meeting too. The comments/ observations made by the Members were examined by the Scientific Panel on Biological Hazards and the revised draft was being placed for approval again after the approval of the Scientific Committee. The Food Authority considered the agenda and approved the recommendations made on the Microbial Standards for Fruits and Vegetable Products as per **Annexure 13** of the Agenda. It was further decided that the comments, if any, on the draft Standards may be considered along with the comments/ suggestions received in response to the draft notification.

**14. Microbiological Standards for Fish & Fisheries Products.**

The Food Authority considered the agenda and approved the recommendations made by the Scientific Committee on the Microbiological Standards for Fish & Fisheries Products along with the draft notification as per **Annexure 14** of the Agenda item subject to the legal vetting of the text.

**15. Dairy Whitener.**

While discussing the Agenda item, it was observed by some of the members that their inputs were not considered in the proposed standard. It was also observed that instead of giving absolute values, it would be prudent to specify a range for certain parameters like Total Sugars etc. In view of the same, the Food Authority decided to refer the Agenda back to the sub-committee, which had been constituted at the last Authority meeting on the subject.

**16. Draft of Alcoholic Beverages Regulations.**

While discussing the Agenda item, it was pointed out by some members that the Industry had certain issues which needed to be looked into. In response to the same, it was informed that while framing the draft Regulations, the Expert Group had consulted members from the Alcoholic Industry associations like CIBAC, ISWAI etc. and additional comments, if any, of the Industry would be considered after the draft Regulation were notified for public comments. With these observations, the Food Authority approved the recommendations made by the Scientific Committee on the draft of Alcoholic Beverages Regulations.

Further, CEO, FSSAI suggested to also send a copy of the Draft Alcoholic Beverages Regulation to all the State Excise Commissioners for their comments.

**17. Fixing permissible level for chromium in Gelatin**

The Food Authority considered the agenda and approved the recommendations made by the Scientific Committee on fixing permissible level for Chromium in Gelatin i.e. "not more than 10 mg/kg" as per Codex Standards as per the draft notification enclosed at **Annexure 20** of the Agenda subject to the legal vetting of the text.

Further, the Authority decided to implement the same with immediate effect in terms of the provisions of Section 18 (c) of the FSS Act, 2006.

**18. Food Safety & Standards for Organic Food Products.**

The Food Authority considered the agenda and approved the recommendations made by the Scientific Committee on Standards for Organic Food Products along with the draft notification placed as **Annexure 21** of the Agenda subject to legal vetting of the text. One member suggested changing 'Fungal preparations *Trichoderma spp.*, *Metarhizium*, *Bauveria*, *Verticillium*, *Noumeria* etc.' and 'Bacterial preparations *Bacillus spp.*, *Pseudomonas fluorescens*' under the 'Restricted' Category from 'Permitted' category, which was agreed to. Further, clause 3.15.3.6 would be deleted from the said draft Standards.





**19. An update on Harmonization of India Standards with Codex and other International Best Practices.**

The Food Authority noted the update on the Harmonization of India Standards with Codex and other International Best Practices.

**20. Draft Quality Standards for Fresh Fruits and Vegetables.**

While discussing the Agenda item, the members observed that the proposed draft standards would lead to a lot of subjectivity during implementation and there was a need to re-examine the same keeping in view the socio-economic conditions prevailing in the country. Hence, the Food Authority decided to re-visit the proposal in consultation with the concerned in Ministry of Agriculture.

**21. Draft Manual on Water Analysis.**

The Food Authority considered the agenda and approved the recommendations made by the Scientific Committee on draft FSSAI Manual on Methods of Analysis of Water. Further, it was also decided to upload the earlier approved 14 FSSAI Manuals, including the Manual on Methods of Analysis of Water, on the FSSAI website and seek comments/ suggestions thereon for further improvement, if any, from various stakeholders by 28<sup>th</sup> Feb, 2015 in a prescribed format.

**22. Proposal for exemption of members of Cooperative Societies, acting as Food Business Operators (Licensed/Registered) from registration as independent FBOs under Licensing/Registration Regulation under FSS Act, 2006.**

The Food Authority noted and appreciating that the proposal was in line with the spirit of the Act, Rules and Regulations, approved the proposal for exemption of members of Cooperative Societies, acting as Food Business Operators (Licensed/ Registered) from registration as independent FBOs under Licensing/ Registration Regulation under FSS Act, 2006.

**23. Supplementary Agenda Items:**

**23.1 Supplementary Agenda Item No. 1: Harmonisation of Horizontal Standards for Food Additives for use in certain food categories or individual food items.**

The Food Authority considered the agenda and approved the recommendations made by the Scientific Committee on Harmonisation of Horizontal Standards for Food Additives for use in certain food categories or individual food items and also implement the same after consultations with all concerned. Representatives of the Industry sought time for furnishing comments and it was decided that the industry would furnish its comments within a period of four weeks from the date of the meeting. It was further decided that keeping in view the utility of applicability of these standards for speedy disposal of the Product Approval cases, the Authority may start implementing the same through an appropriate advisory after the comments were received pending the formal notification.

**23.2 Supplementary Agenda Item No. 2: Standards for Milk & Milk Products.**

The Food Authority considered the agenda and approved the recommendations made by the Scientific Committee on standards for Milk & Milk Products. One of the members made certain observations qua certain categories of food products in this area. It was agreed that the concerned member would furnish her comments to the Food Authority within 10 days for further consideration before sending the same for draft notification.

**23.3 Supplementary Agenda Item No. 3: Proposal for a policy for addressing concerns regarding placing of meat and poultry products on the Indian Market.**

The Food Authority considered the agenda and approved the proposed policy for addressing the concerns regarding placing of meat and poultry products on the Indian Market with a view to sending the same to the WTO for notification immediately.

**23.4 Supplementary Agenda Item No. 4: Inclusion of 2 Pesticides in the draft amendment to Food Safety and Standards (Contaminants, Toxins and Residues) Regulations, 2011.**

The Food Authority considered the agenda and approved the recommendations made by Scientific Committee on inclusion of 2 Pesticides in the draft amendment to Food Safety and Standards (Contaminants, Toxins and Residues) Regulations, 2011 as per the Supplementary Agenda.





**23.5 Supplementary Agenda Item No. 5: Important Orders issued after the last Authority Meeting for information of Food Authority.**

The Food Authority took note of various decisions taken/ orders issued since the last Authority Meeting and endorsed the decisions taken therein. Referring to the orders dated 16.12.2014 and 17.12.2014 regarding grant of extensions, one of the members observed that no further extension should be granted in these cases. The CEO clarified that it had been stipulated on the file that this would be the last extension and necessary action, as suggested by the member, would be taken accordingly.

**23.6 Supplementary Agenda Item No. 6:**

**Part I: Changes in the composition of the Scientific Committee and Scientific Panels for approval of the Food authority;**

The Food Authority considered the agenda and approved the changes proposed in the composition of the Scientific Committee and the Scientific Panels.

**Part II: Constitution of the Working Groups**

The Food Authority noted the agenda item and endorsed the decision taken to create a number of Working Groups. It was observed that the FSSAI should also prepare a database on pool of available knowledge/ experts so that their expertise could be used as and when required.


**24. Concluding remarks:**

24.1 At the end, stating that this would be his last meeting of the Authority, the Chairperson expressed his gratitude to all the members of the Authority for their support and co-operation. He further observed that a lot of what had been promised under Harmonization had been achieved. He expressed his gratitude and appreciation to the contribution of the previous and current members in the functioning of the Authority. He highlighted that the Authority, being an autonomous Statutory Regulatory Body, was constituted with an idea to take decisions independently.

24.2 Further, he reiterated his observations that the members representing the

different groups of stakeholders on the Authority should be the single nodal contact points for raising the concerns of such stakeholder groups as against multiple sources raising their respective issues at different fora. He acknowledged that being at the helm of the Authority at this crucial juncture was full of challenges but it had been possible to achieve a degree of success only with the cooperation of all the members. He emphasized that the Authority was meant to safeguard the interests of the Indian consumers at all times.

- 24.3 CEO, FSSAI, eulogised the sincere efforts & patience with which the Chairperson, FSSAI & Shri S. Dave, Advisor, carried out their humungous work & thanked them for their seminal contribution to the Authority.
- 24.4 Dr. Toteja, Member, speaking on behalf of the members of the Food Authority, acknowledged sterling services rendered by the Chairperson and the Advisor in furtherance of the mandate laid down in the FSS Act, 2006.

  
**Chief Executive Officer**

  
**Chairperson**  
22/1/15



**List of Participants**

**A. Members of the Authority:**

1. Shri K. Chandramouli, Chairperson, FSSAI;
2. Shri Y.S. Malik, CEO/FSSAI and Member Secretary;
3. Sh. K.L. Sharma, Jt. Secretary, Ministry of Health & Family Welfare New Delhi;
4. Dr. Reeta Vashishta, JS & LC, Ministry of Law & Justice, New Delhi;
5. Shri Utpal Kumar Singh, Jt. Secretary, DAC, Krishi Bhawan, New Delhi;
6. Ms. Anuradha Prasad, Jt. Secretary, Ministry of Food Processing Industries, Panchsheel Bhawan, August Kranti Marg, New Delhi;
7. Dr. G. S. Toteja, Director, Desert Medicine Research Centre (DMRC), New Pali Road, ICMR Campus II, TAI, 3 Red Cross Road, New Delhi;
8. Dr. (Ms.) Lalitha Ramakrishna Gowda, Retd. Chief Scientist, 1235, Gange Rd 3<sup>rd</sup> Cross, Kuvempunagar, Mysore – 570023, Karnataka;
9. Shri Salim A. Veljee, Commissioner Food Safety, Goa & Director, Food & Drug Administration, Directorate of Food & Drugs Administration, Dhanwantari, Opp. Shrine of Holy Cross, Bambolim – 403202, Goa;
10. Dr. A.R. Sharma, CMD, M/s Ricela Health Foods Ltd. Village Manwala, Saron Road, Dhuri, Sangrur, Punjab – 148024;
11. Shri Vasudev K. Thakkar, President, 'V' Care Right & Duty NGO. V. Care House Opp. Keval Farm, Karodia Road, Post-Bajwa, Vadodra, Gujarat;
12. Ms Shreya Pandey, All India Food Processors' Association, 206, Aurobindo Place Market, Hauz Khas, New Delhi;
13. Ms. Meetu Kapur, Confederation of Indian Industry (CII), India Habitat Centre, Core 4A, Ground Floor, Lodhi Road, New Delhi;
14. Shri Thanglura, Mizoram Consumers' Union, Lalat Chamber, Temple Square, Tuikual South, Aizwal, Mizoram;
15. Shri Abukalam, Madina Munavara Coffee Estate, Jayapura Koppa Taluk Chikmagalur, Karnataka.

**B. Officers of the FSSAI**

1. Shri S. Dave, Advisor
2. Ms. Vinod Kotwal, Director (Codex/Estt/FA)

3. Dr. Pradeep Chakraborty, Director (NR)
4. Dr. Meenakshi Singh, Scientist (Standards)
5. Dr. Sandhya Kabra, Director (QA/PA/Legal)
6. Shri Rackesh Kulshrestha, JD(M)
7. Shri Anil Mehta, DO (Northern Region)
8. Shri Sanjay Gupta, AD (Enf.)
9. Shri BG Pandian, AD (Imports)
10. Shri P. Karthikeyan, AD (Regulation)
11. Sh. Rajesh Kumar, Scientist (IV)
12. Ms. Ranum Dabbas, Scientist (IV)
13. Ms. Dhanya, Technical Officer